Are Patient Preferences Incorporated into Treatment Decisions?

Nancy L. Keating, MD, MPH
Associate Professor of Medicine & Health Care Policy, Harvard Medical School
February 28, 2011
Questions

• Are patients being informed about treatment options?
• What role are patients playing in treatment decisions?
• What role do patients want in treatment decisions?
Patient VK

• 51 yo woman diagnosed with 2 cm, node negative, estrogen receptor positive breast cancer in 2001

• Surgeon discussed:
  – Mastectomy
  – Breast-conserving surgery—a newer procedure that only took out the cancer, but might not be as effective

• Patient chose mastectomy—the “better treatment”
Breast Cancer Decision Making

• For most women with stage I/II cancer, 2 treatments with equivalent outcomes
  – Mastectomy vs. breast-conserving surgery with radiation (BCS)
  – Evidence since 1980s, NIH Consensus Conference underscores equivalence in 1990

• Choice should be based on patients’ preferences
Substantial Variation in Treatment

MASTECTOMY RATES PER 1,000 FEMALE MEDICARE ENROLLEES, 2005

Source: Dartmouth Atlas
Treatment Decision Making in 2 Cohorts of Cancer Patients

1. 1081 women living in MN or MA diagnosed with stage I/II breast cancer in 1993-1995 asked about breast cancer surgery

2. 5383 patients diagnosed with lung or colorectal cancer in 2003-2005 at a CanCORS site asked about decisions for surgery, chemotherapy, and radiation
CanCORS Sites

- Kaiser Permanente Hawaii (4 major islands)
- Kaiser Permanente Northwest (Portland metropolitan area)
- Group Health Cooperative (Seattle metropolitan area)
- Henry Ford Health System (Detroit metropolitan area)
- Harvard Pilgrim Health Care (Boston metropolitan area)
- Northern California (8 counties in San Jose, San Francisco/Oakland, and Sacramento areas)
- Los Angeles County
- State of Iowa
- North Carolina (22 central/eastern counties)
- Nashville, TN
- Atlanta, GA
- Michigan
- Nashville, TN
- Henry Ford Health System (Detroit metropolitan area)
- New York, NY
- Baltimore, MD
- Durham, NC
- Northern California (8 counties in San Jose, San Francisco/Oakland, and Sacramento areas)
- Los Angeles County
- State of Iowa
- State of Alabama
- Henry Ford Health System (Detroit metropolitan area)
- New York, NY
- Baltimore, MD
- Durham, NC
- Northern California (22 central/eastern counties)
- Nashville, TN
- Atlanta, GA

- Patients from population-based cohorts in geographic areas
- Patients from integrated health-care delivery systems
- Patients at Veterans Health Administration hospitals
Are Patients Being Informed of Treatment Options?
Are Women Being Informed of Options?

MN/MA Cohort and their Physicians

Patient reports MD discussed both: 71%
Surgeon reports discussing both with patient: 82%

Keating et al, Br Ca Res Treat 2003
# Surgeon vs. Patient Report

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Patient Report</th>
<th>Surgeon Report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Discussed Both</td>
<td>Discussed Both</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussed One</td>
<td>Discussed One</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Keating et al, Br Ca Res Treat 2003
What Role are Cancer Patients Playing in Treatment Decisions?
What Role are Patients Playing?

MN/MA Breast Cancer Cohort

Keating et al, J Clin Oncol 2002
What Role are Patients Playing?

CanCORS Lung & Colorectal Cancer Cohort

Keating et al, J Clin Oncol 2010
What Role Do Patients Want to Play in Treatment Decisions?
Patients Vary in Preferences for Participating in Decisions

- Nearly all patients desire information about treatments
- Many prefer passive to active role
  - Older patients
  - Patients with more serious illness
What Role do Patients Desire?

MN/MA Breast Cancer Cohort

Keating et al, J Clin Oncol 2002
What Role do Patients Desire?

CanCORS Lung & Colorectal Cancer Cohort

Keating et al, in progress
How Often Does Patients’ Actual Role Match their Desired Role?
How Often does the Actual Role Match the Desired Role?

MN/MA Breast Cancer Cohort

Keating et al, J Clin Oncol 2002
How Often does the Actual Role Match the Desired Role?

CanCORS Lung & Colorectal Cancer Cohort

Keating et al, in progress
Are There Benefits of Matching Actual Role to Desired Role?

MN/MA Breast Cancer Cohort

Keating et al, J Clin Oncol 2002
Summary

• Patients not always being informed about treatment options, even when good evidence
• Most patients want to participate in treatment decisions, but some do not
• Many patients have little or no participation in treatment decisions
• Only half of patients have an actual role in decisions that matches their preferred role
Acknowledgements

Mary Beth Landrum, PhD
Edward Guadagnoli, PhD
Jane Weeks, MD
Neeraj Arora, PhD
Jennifer Malin, MD
Patricia Ganz, MD
Michelle vanRyn, PhD
Catherine Borbas, PhD
CanCORS Consortium members