Risk Factors are not Predictive Factors Due to Protective Factors

Carl C. Bell, M.D.

C.E.O./President
Community Mental Health Council, Inc.

Professor Psychiatry and Public Health
Director of Public & Community Psychiatry – Department of Psychiatry
University of Illinois at Chicago
An Integrated Understanding of Risk and Protective Factors Is Necessary

Biological Factors
Psychological Factors
Substance Abuse and Mental Illness
Child Abuse
Social Factors
Sociopolitical and Cultural Factors
Risk Factors are not predictive factors due to the presence of protective factors!
PROTECTIVE FACTORS

Biologic
– Intellectual ability (Not just book smarts)
– Personality traits
– Toughness

Psychological
– Intrapsychic attributes
  • Adaptive mechanisms such as ego resiliency
  • Motivation
  • Humor
  • Hardiness
  • Perceptions of self
PROTECTIVE FACTORS

Psychological

– *Emotional attributes*
  - Emotional well-being
  - Life satisfaction
  - Optimism
  - Happiness
  - Trust
  - Dispositional optimism
  - Dispositional hope
PROTECTIVE FACTORS

Psychological

– *Cognitive attributes*
  - Cognitive styles
  - Causal attribution such as an internal locus of control and blame
  - World view or philosophy of life
  - Wisdom

– *Spiritual attributes*

– *Attributes of posttraumatic growth*
PROTECTIVE FACTORS

Social
– Interpersonal skills
– Interpersonal relationships
– Connectedness
– Social support

Environmental
– Positive life events
– Socioeconomic status

Triadic Theory of Influence

Sociological theories of social control and social bonding (Akers et al., 1979; Elliott et al., 1985)
Peer clustering (Oetting & Beauvais, 1986)
Cultural identity (Oetting & Beauvais, 1990-91)
Psychological theories of attitude change & behavioral prediction (Fishbein & Ajzen, 1975; Ajzen, 1985)
Personality development (Digman, 1990)
Social learning (Akers et al., 1979; Bandura, 1977, 1986)
Integrative theories (e.g., Jessor & Jessor's, Problem Behavior Theory; Brook’s Family Interaction Theory, Hawkins’ Social Development Theory)
Figure 2. Three Streams of Influence on Health-related Behavior
Community Psychiatry
Protective Factor Field
Principles

Rebuilding the Village/Constructing Social Fabric
Access to Modern Medical Technology
Connectedness
Social Skills
Self Esteem
  – Activities that create a sense of power
  – Activities that create a sense of connectedness
  – Activities that create a sense of models
  – Activities that create a sense of uniqueness
Reestablish the Adult Protective Shield
Minimize the Effects of Trauma
This model has been used to change health behaviors in several studies

Aban Aya – Formal Violence Prevention, Drug Abuse Prevention and Sexual Risk Taking Prevention study
Chicago Public Schools – Naturalistic study
CHAMP/South Side Chicago – Formal HIV Prevention Study
CHAMP/New York – Formal HIV Prevention Study
CHAMP/South Africa – Formal HIV Prevention Study
CHAMP/Trinidad – Formal HIV Prevention Study
McLean/Peoria County – Naturalistic Study
Rebuilding the Village/Constructing Social Fabric

Any player starts

Citizens/Civic Groups
Local Government
Hospitals/Providers
Schools/Parks and Recreation
Business/Key Others
Public Health Agencies
Churches/Nonprofits

First player brings the others to the table

Every player contributes
Together players build a vision for a healthy city/community
How are we functioning?

- Different language
- Different goals
- Activity-driven
- Resource silos
We need Synergy and an Integrated System
A basic principle of the CHAMP intervention was to help families collaborate to form mutual support groups.

The idea was that by families pooling resources to monitor children, the children would be safer from engaging in high risk behaviors associated with contracting the HIV virus.

ADULT Neighborhood Social Control

Pretest Means  Posttest Means

Intervention
Comparison

p < .0224
Effect size = 0.226
ADULT

Neighborhood disorganization

Pretest Means  Posttest Means

Intervention
Comparison

$p < .0026$
Effect size $= -0.3134$
Bonding And Attachment Dynamics

Provide opportunities for youth to become attached to their schools.
Expand the school day and school year to provide structured academic activities and recreational activities for children after the regular school day, including a nutritional dinner meal, and during the summer.
Promote the use of school uniforms.

ADULT Social Networks – Primary

Pretest Means | Posttest Means

Intervention: p < .01, Effect size = 0.2653
Comparison:

Graph showing increased values for intervention compared to comparison group post-test.
ADULT
Social Networks - Secondary

Pretest Means
Posttest Means

Intervention
Comparison

p < .0002
Effect size = 0.4531
Social Skills

**Discipline**
- Use of positive parenting
- Effectiveness of discipline
- Avoidance of discipline

**Supervision and monitoring of the child**
- Extent of involvement
- Knowledge of child’s activities and whereabouts
Aban-Aya's Afro-centric risk behavior prevention curriculum teaches skills to refuse offers and resist social pressures, assertiveness, negotiation, and conflict resolution, and gives youth the opportunity to practice these skills to aid in their ability to avoid high risk health behaviors.

SOCIAL SKILLS
ABAN AYA

These social skills are taught in the context of also learning decision making ("Stop, Think and Act") and problem solving skills.

Understanding the feelings of self and others (empathy), goal setting, and other self-management skills are also taught.

SOCIAL SKILLS
ABAN AYA

Indicators of Violence

- HEC
- SC/SDC

1st Wave
2nd Wave
3rd Wave
4th Wave
5th Wave
6th Wave
CHAMP works to help youth develop good communication skills by helping youth and parents learn about and practice their communication skills in multiple family groups. We also give parents social skills that help them in supervision and monitoring of the child that increase involvement with the child, and knowledge of children's activities and whereabouts.

ADULT
Hard to Talk-Comfort

Pretest Means  Posttest Means

Intervention
Comparison

p < .0001
Effect size = 0.4067
ADULT

Hard to Talk-Frequency

Pretest Means  Posttest Means

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Comparison</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>21.5</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Effect size = 0.1969

p < .05
CHILD
Hard to Talk About Frequency

Pretest Means  Posttest Means

Intervention
Comparison
p < .066
Effect size = 0.24
Self Esteem

Sense of power.
  – A feeling competent to do what they must.

Sense of uniqueness.
  – Acknowledging and respecting the qualities and characteristics about themselves that are special and different.

Self Esteem

Sense of models.
- Models that they can use make sense of the world.

Sense of being connected.
- Feeling satisfaction from being connected to people, places or things.

Sense of Models

Provide people with models and practice, practice, practice on how to:
- Communicate
- Solve problems
- Provide leadership
- Manage resources
- Remove barriers to success
- Plan
Racial identity serves as a buffer against stress and helps African American youth to function with competence under adverse conditions. An Afrocentric orientation positively moderates the relationship between psychobehavioral variables and drug use in 1/3 of Af-Am youth.

ADULT AIDS Transmission Knowledge

Pretest Means  Posttest Means

Intervention  Comparison

$p < .0004$

Effect size = 0.6306
CHILD
AIDS Transmission Knowledge

Pretest Means vs. Posttest Means

- **Intervention**
- **Comparison**

- $p < .0001$
- Effect size = 0.496
ADULT Stigma

Pretest Means | Posttest Means

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Comparison</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>p &lt; .0001</td>
<td>Effect size = 0.403</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHILD Stigma

Pretest Means | Posttest Means

Intervention | Comparison

p < .0001

Effect size = 0.698
Re-establishing The Adult Protective Shield

Family-oriented intervention to change parenting style and practices can reduce risk for serious antisocial behavior and violence.

Increase predictability

Parental monitoring of children

Decrease negative parenting methods
ADULT Caregiver monitoring – Family Rules

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pretest Means</th>
<th>Posttest Means</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Intervention: p < .0018
Effect size = 0.3074

Comparison:
CHILD Caregiver involvement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pretest Means</th>
<th>Posttest Means</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>23.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>24.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>26.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Intervention
Comparison

p < .03
Effect size = 0.2
ADULT Punitive parenting

Pretest Means Posttest Means

Intervention Comparison

p < .001

Effect size = 0.xxx
Outcomes in McLean County FY00 through FY02
Reported Abuse and Neglect by Race

European-American (-19.3%)
African-American (-1.5%)
Hispanic (-13.6%)
Outcomes in McLean County FY00 through FY02
Children Removed by Race

- European-American: FY00 - 3.69, FY02 - 1.16
- African-American: FY00 - 35.05, FY02 - 13.58
- Hispanic: FY00 - 1.16, FY02 - 1.16

Bar chart showing the removal of children by race and fiscal year.
Categories of Adverse Experiences

Psychological abuse
Physical abuse
Sexual abuse
Violence against mother
Living with household members who were substance abusers
Living with household members who were mentally ill or suicidal
Living with ex-offender household members.
Results

The most prevalent of the 7 categories of child exposure was substance abuse in the household (25.6%).
The least prevalent exposure category was evidence of criminal behavior in the household (3.4%).
More than half of respondents (52%) experienced ≥ 1 category of adverse childhood exposure.
6.2% reported ≥ 4 exposures.
Results

Persons who experienced 4 or more categories of childhood exposure, compared to those who had experienced none, had a:

– 7.4 fold increase for alcoholism
– 10.3 fold increase for drug abuse
– 4.6 fold increase for depression
– 12.2 fold increase in suicide attempts.
Results

Persons who experienced 4 or more categories of childhood exposure, compared to those who had experienced none had a:

- 2.2-fold increase in smoking
- 2.2-fold increase in poor self-rated health
- 3.2-fold increase in $\geq 50$ sexual intercourse partners
- 2.5-fold increase in sexually transmitted disease
Results

Persons who experienced 4 or more categories of childhood exposure compared to those who had experienced none had

- a 2.2 fold increase in ischemic heart disease
- A 1.9 fold increase cancer,
- A 3.9 fold increase in chronic lung disease (bronchitis and emphysema),
- A 1.6 fold increase in skeletal fractures,
- and a 2.4 fold increase in liver disease.
**Trauma is Ubiquitous**

Bell & Jenkins (1985) found that 25% and 30% of inner-city Chicago children, ages 7-15, had seen a shooting and stabbing, respectively.

Using structured telephone interviews in a national sample of 4,008 adult women, Resnick et al (1993) found a lifetime rate of exposure to any type of traumatic event of 69%.

Kessler et al (The National Comorbidity Survey - 1995) found that more than one half of nearly 6,000 subjects, ages 15 – 54, had experienced a traumatic event during their lifetime and most people had experienced more than one.

Breslau et al (1998) examined trauma exposure and the diagnosis of PTSD in a telephoned community sample of 2,181 individuals in the Detroit area and found that the lifetime prevalence of trauma exposure was 89.6%.
Exposure To A Traumatic Event Does Not Automatically Put A person On A Path To Develop PTSD: The Importance of Protective Factors To Promote Resiliency

Kessler et al (1995) found 8% of males and 20% of females
Breslau et al (1992) found 10% of males and 14% of females who were exposed to trauma had a lifetime prevalence rate of PTSD

Exposure to a traumatic stress does automatically mean a victim of trauma is predisposed to develop PTSD.

Most people affected by a trauma event will adapt in a period of 3 – 6 months following trauma (Riggs et al, 1995) and only a small proportion will develop long-term psychiatric disorders (Bryant, 2006; Bryant 2006).
Minimizing Effects Of Trauma

Cognitive style predicts PTSD up to three years after trauma exposure.

Specifically, 24% of posttraumatic stress at follow-up is predicted by pre-trauma catastrophic appraisals about the future and one’s symptoms.

Maladaptive appraisals about themselves, rather than maladaptive appraisals about the world or self-blame, contributes PTSD.

Thus, self-oriented appraisals, e.g. having a lack of self-efficacy, contribute to the risk of getting PTSD after a traumatic exposure.


Thus, turning learned helplessness into learned helpfulness is a protective factor against PTSD.

Institutionalization and Sustainability

- Knowledge Base/Science
- Implementation System/Effector Limb
- Public Will/PR & Marketing