

*The National Academies of*  
**SCIENCES • ENGINEERING • MEDICINE**

**Forum on Public-Private Partnerships for Global Health and Safety**

**Exploring Partnership Governance in Global Health – A Workshop**

**October 26, 2017**

**The National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine**

**500 Fifth St. NW, Washington, DC 20001**

**AGENDA**

The Forum on Public-Private Partnerships for Global Health and Safety (PPP Forum) fosters a collaborative community of multisectoral leaders from business, government, foundations, humanitarian and professional organizations, academia, and civil society to leverage the strengths of multiple sectors and disciplines to yield benefits for global health and safety. The PPP Forum is premised on the understanding that partnerships among these stakeholders can facilitate dialogue and knowledge exchange; utilize technological and process efficiencies; promote innovation; and synergistically advance humanitarian, international development, and global health interests. The U.S. National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine provides a neutral evidence-based platform through which the PPP Forum is convened.

This public workshop on partnership governance in global health has been planned by an ad hoc expert committee. The intended audience is the PPP Forum members and the organizations they represent, other public and private entities that have participated in or are considering collaboration across sectors to further global health and safety, and academics and researchers across multiple disciplines who are focused on understanding the value proposition and impact of various models of public-private partnerships to improve global health.

**Workshop Objectives:**

- Examine what role governance assumes in public-private partnerships for global health and how governance impacts the effectiveness of these partnerships in improving health outcomes
- Consider the range of stakeholders and sectors engaged in global health partnerships and how specific organizational attributes impact a partnership's governance and decision-making processes
- Explore best practices, common challenges, and lessons learned in the varying approaches to partnership governance
- Illuminate the key issues in the governance of public-private partnerships for global health with the goal of increasing their effectiveness in improving health outcomes

**Workshop Context:**

Definitions of governance are varied and depend on factors such as the relevant actors, level of analysis, and existing political and social contexts. Broadly, governance is conceived of as the “art of steering societies and organizations” (IOG). Within the context of public-private partnerships (PPPs), governance refers to the structures, processes, and practices for decision-making and for ultimately accomplishing the goal of the partnership. Governance defines the power structure of a PPP by regulating who makes decisions and how and when the decisions are made, as well as how other stakeholders are represented in the process. Effective governance mechanisms can be a tool for providing direction and monitoring performance, promoting accountability and transparency, enhancing legitimacy and ownership, and managing both real and perceived conflicts of interest.

The governance of a partnership impacts its efficiency and effectiveness in meeting its stated goal: strong governance can improve the performance of PPPs while weak governance can undermine it. In global health, PPPs have played a critical role in addressing global health needs; however, they require careful steering to avoid potential pitfalls (Reich, 2002). An examination of PPPs in global health has revealed some common shortcomings in their governance, including weakness in or absence of strategic direction, accountability mechanisms, monitoring and evaluation systems, and risk management; lack of clarity in roles and responsibilities; confusion

between the roles of management versus governance; and inadequate attention to resource mobilization and to the human resources required to deliver programs and achieve objectives (Bezanson & Isenman, 2012).

While the importance of governance in global health partnerships has been identified, there is, in general, a lack of agreement on best practices for their governance structures, policies, and practice (Stenson, 2010). This is partly because of the significant variation across global health partnerships in size, including the number of partners engaged, resources allocated, geographic focus, and scope of the goals; the focus area, ranging from infectious diseases to pandemic preparedness and to non-communicable diseases and injury prevention; the level of formality; and the intended outcomes. Over the last several decades, with the increased number of interested stakeholders, resources invested, and initiatives launched within the global health field, effective governance of global health PPPs is critical.

These PPPs are formal collaborative arrangements through which public and private parties share risks, responsibilities, and decision-making processes with the goal of collectively addressing a shared health objective. While it is assumed that both government and a private sector actor will be formally engaged in the partnership, it is worth noting the range of stakeholders engaged in global health partnerships, such as national governments, bilateral development cooperation agencies, United Nations agencies, multilateral and regional development banks, hybrid global health initiatives, philanthropic organizations, civil society organizations and nongovernmental organizations, private businesses, and academic institutions. Given the broad range of determinants that affect and are affected by health, there are many sub-categories within these stakeholder groups that are engaged in global health partnerships, for example, within national governments, ministries of health, finance, telecommunications, and transportation among others. These numerous stakeholders bring varying strengths and resources to global health partnerships, but they also carry their own organizational cultures, regulations, and expectations. Managing PPPs among these stakeholders is complex and requires intentional and thoughtful governance.

This workshop will explore the governance of partnerships that are defined by the following parameters: 1) a clearly defined shared goal that centers on meeting the health needs of disadvantaged populations; 2) the inclusion of at least three partners with a government entity and business represented among them; 3) development of formal joint agreement among the partners with defined set of rules; 4) contributions of resources from all partners (resources can include financing, technical expertise, innovation, personnel, relationships, and research); and 5) expected value for all partners.

---

#### **WORKSHOP NOTES**

---

- This workshop is being recorded. Please identify your name & affiliation when asking questions.
- We are webcasting this event live online, link can be found on our webpage: <http://ow.ly/XwMq30f9MVp>
- Please use hashtag **#PPPGlobalForum** to tweet about this event.
- Soon after the meeting an archive of the video webcast and presentation slides will be available on our webpage.
- A proceedings of the workshop will be published by the National Academies Press.
- Sign up at: [nas.edu/PPPGlobalForum](http://nas.edu/PPPGlobalForum) for updates from the PPP Forum.

---

#### **PLANNING COMMITTEE ROSTER**

---

Clarion Johnson (co-chair), Private Consultant, ExxonMobil

Regina Rabinovich, (co-chair), ExxonMobil Malaria Scholar in Residence, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health

Jo Ivey Boufford, Immediate Past President, The New York Academy of Medicine

Kevin Etter, Director, UPS Loaned Executive Program

Lauren Marks, Director, Private Sector Engagement for PEPFAR, U.S. Department of State

John Monahan, Senior Fellow & Senior Advisor for Global Initiatives to the President, Georgetown University

Cate O’Kane, Independent Consultant

B.T. Slingsby, CEO and Executive Director, Global Health Innovative Technology Fund

---

#### **STAFF**

---

Rachel Taylor, Forum Director

Priyanka Nalamada, Research Associate

Katherine Perez, Senior Program Assistant

**8:00A Registration**

**8:30A Welcome**  
DAN MOTE  
President  
National Academy of Engineering

**8:35A Introduction to the Workshop from the Planning Committee Co-Chairs**  
CLARION JOHNSON\*  
Private Consultant  
ExxonMobil  
  
REGINA RABINOVICH\*  
ExxonMobil Malaria Scholar in Residence  
Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health

**I. Global Health and Governance of Public-Private Partnerships in the Current Context**

This opening session will provide an overview of the current trends and challenges in the governance of global health public-private partnerships (PPPs). The session will begin with a review of the existing literature on the governance structures, processes, and practices of global health PPPs. The roles of transparency and accountability will be explored in the governance of global health PPPs, with a focus on organizational design and decision-making. Governance issues for discussion will include power dynamics and equity, inclusion and participation in decision-making, and the management of real and perceived conflicts of interest.

*Session Moderator:* REGINA RABINOVICH

**8:50A The Core Roles of Transparency and Accountability in the Governance of Global Health PPPs**  
MICHAEL R. REICH  
Taro Takemi Research Professor of International Health Policy  
Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health

**9:15A Addressing Major Challenges in the Governance of Global Health PPPs:  
Panel Discussion**

STEVE DAVIS  
President and CEO  
PATH

MARK DYBUL  
Professor of Medicine and Faculty Director  
Georgetown University Center for Global Health and Quality

MUHAMMAD PATE  
CEO  
Big Win Philanthropy

TACHI YAMADA  
Venture Partner  
Frazier Healthcare Partners

**10:15A      BREAK**

**II.      Legal Considerations for PPP Governance in Global Health**

Through a problem-solving exercise, this session will surface legal considerations within different sectors when developing global health PPPs. The discussion will aim to address questions including—What governance structures, processes, and practices are advisable from a legal perspective given a myriad of considerations such as leadership, conflicts of interest, data ownership, publicity, and flexibility in decision making? How does or should PPP governance emulate private sector governance? How does it differ? What are the legal considerations when operating across countries and international systems? In terms of acknowledging and valuing resources from all partners questions include—How are resources contributed from each partner acknowledged within the governance document? How is the value of in-kind resources defined? Panelists will discuss these questions and elaborate on the legal and regulatory constraints they have encountered and problem-solved for when structuring PPPs.

*Session Moderator:* LAUREN MARKS\*  
Director, Private Sector Engagement for PEPFAR  
U.S. Department of State

**10:30A      Panel Discussion**

DOUGLAS BROOKS  
Senior Director for Community Engagement  
Gilead Sciences, Inc.

ANTHONY BROWN  
Senior Legal Counsel  
Gavi, the Vaccine Alliance

KENNETH MILLER  
Associate General Counsel  
The Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation

NINA NATHANI  
Partner  
Matalon & Nathani, LLP

VALERIE WENDEROTH  
Attorney-Advisor  
U.S. Department of State

**12:00P      LUNCH**

### **III. Internal Governance of Individual Partners and Impacts on Approaches to Public-Private Partnerships**

The internal governance structures, processes, and practices of individual partners impact how they approach and engage in PPPs. Greater clarity and understanding of the practical, legal, and regulatory constraints of individual organizations, which may impact the partnership and how it is governed, can promote transparency and manage expectations. Through defined strategies, priorities, and procedures for partnership engagement that reflect their internal governance considerations, individual organizations can articulate their expectations, needs, and limitations prior to engagement and throughout the partnership operations. Developing a partnership strategy not only provides a signal to other stakeholders and potential partners but also requires organizations to internally review and assess their own priorities, expectations, and resources as they develop their capacity to engage in PPPs. In this interactive session, participants will collectively discuss the issue and related questions posed by the facilitators. The session will be conducted in two rounds followed by a harvest with the larger group to reflect on the themes and deeper questions that arose during small group discussions.

*Session Facilitator:* JO IVEY BOUFFORD\*  
Immediate Past President  
New York Academy of Medicine

KEVIN ETTER\*  
Director  
UPS Loaned Executive Program

#### **1:00P World Café/Small Table Interactive Discussions**

### **IV. Lessons Learned from Development, Iterative Improvement, and Reform of Public-Private Partnerships and their Governance**

In this session panelists will first illuminate their decision making when developing and establishing a PPP and its governance structure, processes, and practices. Panelists will share lessons learned from experiences in determining governance needs and mechanisms based on the partnership goal; engaging partners and other stakeholders in decision-making for the design of the PPP and its governance; developing the governance mechanism; and defining metrics for evaluating the effectiveness of the PPP and its governance performance.

Subsequently panelists will delve into the creation of iterative processes for the continuous improvement of PPP governance as well as approaching PPP reform. Using the experiences of their respective partnerships, panelists will share lessons learned in decision-making when adjusting to evolving priorities of the PPP to partners and in the broader global health environment, and related impacts of issues such as expectations, language, and internal decision-making processes of each partner.

*Session Moderator:* CLARION JOHNSON\*

#### **2:00P Panel Presentations and Discussion**

**Access Accelerated**  
DANIELLE ROLLMANN  
Access Priorities, Global Policy  
Pfizer Inc.

**The DREAMS Partnership**  
LAUREN MARKS\*  
Director, Private Sector Engagement for PEPFAR  
U.S. Department of State

**Global Health Innovative Technology Fund**  
BT SLINGSBY\*  
CEO and Executive Director  
Global Health Innovative Technology Fund

**ACHAP Partnership in Botswana**  
JEFF STURCHIO  
Board Member, ACHAP  
President and CEO, Rabin Martin

**Avahan Program in India**  
SONAL MEHTA  
Chief Executive  
Alliance India

**3:30P      BREAK**

**V.      Evaluating and Reporting on Public-Private Partnerships in Global Health**

When conducted effectively, evaluating and reporting on the progress of PPPs on their stated goals and outcomes promotes transparency and accountability, and can guide decision-making within the partnership. Standardizing reporting and making it publicly accessible could contribute to decision-making in global health more broadly. This session will present an initiative to develop a framework to standardize measurement and reporting across private sector initiatives to improve access to NCD treatment and care. The presentation will focus on the decision-making process for the framework's design and how it is being applied. Following the presentation, participants will engage in a discussion on the potential of such frameworks for decision-making in the development and operations of partnerships in global health.

Session Moderator: JOHN MONAHAN\*  
Senior Advisor for Global Health  
Georgetown University

**3:45P      Evaluation of Access Accelerated**  
VERONIKA WIRTZ  
Associate Professor, Global Health  
Boston University

PETER ROCKERS  
Assistant Professor, Global Health  
Boston University

## **VI. Identifying Key Issues in the Governance of Public-Private Partnerships in Global Health**

The objectives of this session are to identify the key issues in the governance of global health partnerships, and apply what has been learned to decision-making in the establishment of a new partnership. During the session, governance issues raised in the earlier sessions will be reviewed, participants will be guided through a role-playing exercise to apply lessons learned from the workshop, and key messages from the workshop will be identified.

*Session Facilitator:* CATE O'KANE\*  
Independent Consultant

- 4:15P**      **Report Back from World Café**  
JO BOUFFORD  
KEVIN ETTER
- 4:25P**      **Facilitated Small Group Activity**
- 5:55P**      **Closing Remarks**  
REGINA RABINOVICH  
CLARION JOHNSON
- 6:15P**      **Adjourn to Informal Reception**