Graduate Medical Education Outcome and Metrics
Current Metrics: What is Measured Now?

ABMS Board Certification: Achieving Board Certification

Lois Margaret Nora, MD, JD, MBA
American Board of Medical Specialties
11 October 2017
Disclosure

• Dr. Nora is a salaried employee of the American Board of Medical Specialties
Outline of Comments

• ABMS Board Certification – defining the specialist
• What does it measure?
• Example: American Board of Surgery Certification
• Trends and Moving Forward
American Medicine – Early 20th Century
Professional Self-Regulation and the Social Compact

Have special knowledge and skills

Profession given substantial autonomy to self-regulate

Patients before self-interest

The privilege of professional self-regulation can be lost
Specialty Standards...

- define the discipline
- inform ACGME Program Requirements for residency and fellowship training
- inform assessment during and following residency training
- are updated periodically to reflect evolution of the specialty with changes in medical knowledge, skills, and procedures
## 24 ABMS Member Boards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Specialty</th>
<th>Specialty</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Allergy and Immunology</td>
<td>Orthopaedic Surgery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anesthesiology</td>
<td>Otolaryngology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colon and Rectal Surgery</td>
<td>Pathology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dermatology</td>
<td>Pediatrics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency Medicine</td>
<td>Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Medicine</td>
<td>Plastic Surgery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internal Medicine</td>
<td>Preventive Medicine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical Genetics and Genomics</td>
<td>Psychiatry and Neurology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neurological Surgery</td>
<td>Radiology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nuclear Medicine</td>
<td>Surgery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Obstetrics and Gynecology</td>
<td>Thoracic Surgery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ophthalmology</td>
<td>Urology</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ABMS Board Certification

- Distinct from medical licensure
- Board certification - ABMS Board Certification
- Grounded in the standards that define the specialty
- Statement that the physician meets the professionalism, knowledge, skills and behaviors standards of the Specialty Board
- A process; a credential; an outcome; an identity
Achieving ABMS Board Certification - A Process

• On-going assessment of knowledge, skills, and professionalism across an extended period of time
• Completion of training in an ACGME-accredited residency or fellowship program
• Statement by program director
• Successful performance on Board-based assessment
• Other requirements
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Requirement</th>
<th># of Boards</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Successful completion of high-stakes examination (knowledge-focused; with judgement, clinical reasoning)</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral examinations (case discussions, skills evaluations, hypothetical situations, etc.)</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice requirements (minimum number of cases or time in practice, NOTE: may occur after completion of training)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional recommendations (from peers or hospital leadership, not training program director)</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedural/case log books</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital privileges</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elements of certification examination administered during residency</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Certification by another ABMS Board</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completion of both Self-Assessment and Improvement in Medical Practice activities</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Completion of other academic courses</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
American Board of Surgery - Certificate in General Surgery

- **Purpose:** To pass judgment on the education, training and knowledge of broadly qualified and responsible surgeons

- **Training Requirements**
  - 5 years progressive residency training; Care of 40 surgical critical care patients
  - 12 months of Chief rotation
  - Successful completion of ACLS, ATLS, FLS, FES
  - Observed patient interactions; Observed operations (early in training)
  - Program Director attestation of completion of educational experience and attainment of high level of knowledge, clinical judgment, and technical skills, as well as ethical standing

- **Other Requirements**
  - Completed Cases (850 cases minimum; 250 cases completed by end of PGY2; 200 in Chief Resident year; 25 as teaching resident)
  - Surgical privileges

- **Exam Process**
  - Practice requirement or engaged in pursuing additional graduate education
  - Single-day computer-based certification exam (offered after completion of PGY-4)
  - Oral certifying exam requiring a passing score (offered after successful completion of general surgery qualifying exam)
Evidence

- Patient outcomes over a wide variety of clinical conditions are better when care is provided by an ABMS board-certified physician
- Fewer disciplinary actions
- Board certification is an important distinguisher in clinical privileging
- Board certification is important to users of the health care system

Lessons Learned, Trends

• Limited understanding of board certification in medical school
• Oral examination – provides unique information (clinical reasoning, ethical analysis, etc.)
• Increased use of technology in the assessment process
• Movement toward early introduction of certification activities into residency
• Movement toward phased process to initial certification
• Movement toward simulation-style assessments
• Movement toward practice-based assessments
Questions

• What measures give us the most important information?
• What measures give us unique information?
• What do measures say about length of training, style of training?
Outcomes – Thinking Long Term

Changes Over Time:

- **Science** (HIV, Genomics, Pharmacotherapy);
- **Practice** (Peptic Ulcer, Acute MI, TBI);
- **Setting** (In-patient to Ambulatory);
- **Dangers** (From limited efficacy & safe to substantial efficacy & dangerous);
- **Construct** (From Captain of the ship to Team member/sometimes leader);
- **Social culture** (Beneficent paternalism to Patient autonomy; Public demand);
- **Pace of change** (Rapid to super-rapid);
- **Physician** (Roles, Wisdom, Age, Abilities, Life stressors, Ability to self-assess)