



Integrity Governance and Retraction Practices in Chinese University Journals

中国高校科技期刊科研诚信治理与撤稿实践

ZHANG Tieming

Society of China University Journals(CUJS)

Integrity Governance : Policy and Actions in China 中国的诚信治理政策和行动

From "passive investigation and punishment" to the combination of "proactive prevention" and "systematic governance".

从“被动查处”到“主动预防”与“系统治理”相结合

Expansion of Governance Scope: From traditional paper plagiarism and data falsification to covering broader research misconduct, including research ethics violations, data security breaches, and non-compliance with publication standards.

治理范围扩大

Strengthened inter-departmental coordination and linkage: policy coordination among the Ministry of Science and Technology, the Ministry of Education, the National Natural Science Foundation of China (NSFC), the Chinese Academy of Sciences (CAS) and other departments has formed a synergistic governance force. 部门协同与联动增强

Legalization, systematization, and regularization, with a significant increase in transparency 法治化、系统化、常态化, 透明度显著提高

Actions

中国的科研诚信治理行动

The special section on research integrity development of the official website of **the Ministry of Science and Technology** regularly releases notifications on research integrity cases.



The official website of **the National Natural Science Foundation of China** regularly releases notifications on research integrity cases.



The Medical Research Integrity Website of the Department of Science, Technology and Education under **the National Health Commission of China** releases integrity-related information and research integrity cases.



The Ministry of Education investigated into published articles and retracted articles.



Penalties are becoming increasingly severe.

Practices in Chinese University Journals

中国高校科技期刊诚信治理实践

The system of three review stages and three proofreading rounds for journals

三审三校制度

Peer review system

同行评议制度

Post-publication review system for journals

发表后审读制度

Ethics approval requirements

伦理审批要求

Image, text, AI content, papermill detection

图片、文字、AI内容及论文工厂检测

Correction and retraction Mechanism

勘误和撤稿机制

General principles for university journals to enhance research integrity

高校期刊强化论文诚信治理的大致原则

- Accepting normal corrections and errata with clearly defined handling procedures
允许正常的更正与勘误，有明确的处理流程
- The author and journal can discuss to withdraw article with serious flaws and controversies
对于存在严重缺陷和争议的论文，作者和期刊讨论后可以撤回
- Editor' s concern on problem-based articles under investigation
对于存在问题与争议、处于调查阶段的论文表示编辑关切
- Retracting articles with obvious ethical and integrity issues
对存在明显的伦理与诚信问题的论文撤稿
- Changing authorship is generally not accepted. If a change is necessary, sufficient proof must be provided
变更作者一般不接受，确需变更，需要提供充分的证明
- Identify papermill articles by email address, subject relevance, content rationality, and telephone communication with the author
通过邮件地址、学科相关性、内容合理性、与作者电话交流等来甄别论文工厂论文
- Providing detailed guidelines and requirements for ethical censorship
给出伦理审核的详细指南和要求
- Providing clear guidelines for the use of AI tools in articles publication
给出AI工具在论文发表中使用的明确指南

Retraction Reasons (with integrity problems)

诚信问题撤稿原因

- Authorship/institutional affiliation dispute 作者身份/机构身份争议
- Data fabrication or unauthorized use 数据造假或未经授权使用
- Plagiarism 抄袭剽窃
- Duplicate publication 重复发表
- Image tampering or illegally generated images 图像篡改或违法生成
- Ethic problems 伦理问题
- Non-compliant and unreliable AI-generated content 不合理的AI生成
- Paper mills 论文工厂
- Non-compliant annotation of funding/sponsored projects 基金或资助项目标注不当

Retraction Process (with integrity problems)

撤稿流程 (涉嫌诚信问题)



Problems

高校科技期刊诚信治理问题

Lack of
transparency and
non - compliance in
retraction

撤稿不透明、不规范

- ◆ Retraction information is not displayed on the journal's own website
期刊自己网站不显示撤稿信息
- ◆ Third-party platform conflates retraction with withdrawal, and does not retain the full text of retracted articles
第三方平台撤稿和撤回混为一谈, 且未保留撤稿论文全文
- ◆ Some articles are retracted without any information or declaration on the third-party platform 第三方平台撤稿一些论文后不显示任何撤稿信息
- ◆ For some controversial articles, evidence collection and investigation are difficult, leading to prolonged retraction processes
个别争议论文调查取证难, 撤稿过程拖延
- ◆ Journal editorial policies are unclear and incomplete
期刊编辑政策不清晰、不完善

撤稿声明

Declaration of retraction

本刊对下述论文撤稿:

出版信息	2018年39卷11期, 页码为39-40
论文标题	连云港地区坛紫菜与条斑紫菜轮养效益显著
稿次	<input type="checkbox"/> 录用定稿 <input type="checkbox"/> 排版定稿 <input type="checkbox"/> 整期定稿 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> 印刷版 <input type="checkbox"/> 其它
作者	[Redacted]
DOI	10.3969/j.issn.1004-2091.2018.11.015
撤稿原因	作者一稿多投, 论文重复发表
其他说明	

Duplicate publication

特此告知并诚挚地向读者致歉。

Declaration of withdrawal

2018年12月29日

(开时间, 不代表文献的发表时间)

是作者, 免费下载

撤回声明

下载: 149 页码: 39-40 页数: 2 大小: 48K

连云港地区坛紫菜与条斑紫菜轮养效益显著

撤回

withdrawal

一种是北方海域栽培的条斑紫菜(Pyropia yezoensis), 主要栽培区域为长江口以北的黄海海域, 江苏沿海为主产区。条斑紫菜, 是做寿司的原料。另一个栽培种是坛紫菜(Pyropia haitanensis), 主要栽培区为长江口以南的浙江与福建沿海。坛紫菜

◆ Third-party platform conflates retraction with withdrawal, and does not retain the full text of retracted papers

- China university journals do not pursue profitability, the overall academic rigor is good
高校期刊不追求盈利，整体学术严谨性较好
- Ensuring transparency, standards, and norms for retraction 保证撤稿的透明、标准、规范
- The integrity governance system at the national and Ministry of Education levels is gradually improving and strengthening, the number and proportion of retracted papers will decrease
国家和教育部层面诚信治理体系逐渐完善，力度越来越强，未来撤稿论文数量及比例会下降
- AI complicates research integrity AI使诚信问题复杂化
- The education, supervision, and guidance of universities and research institutions are very important, and it is necessary to establish an integrity curriculum system for graduate students and young scholars 大学和研究机构的教育、监督、指南非常重要，需要构建研究生和青年学者的诚信课程体系
- 24hReview system by CUJS provides integrity and quality review of submissions
24hReview提供论文诚信及质量预审
- The Research Integrity and Copyright Committee of CUJS will issue various integrity guidelines and designated November 11th as Research Integrity Day every year
CUJS学术诚信与版权专委会将出台各项诚信指南，确定每年11月11日为学术诚信日
- Strengthening collaboration among international and domestic publishers and institutions, establishing collaborative mechanisms 加强国际国内学术机构、出版机构之间的合作，建立协同机制

THANKS