Are Managed Retreat Programs Successful And Just? A Global Mapping Of Success Typologies, Justice Dimensions, And Trade-offs.

Jola Ajibade, Department of Geography, Portland State University
Washington, DC
April 8, 2022
Acknowledgements

- Research Group: Meghan Sullivan, Chris Lower, Allie Reilly, Lizzie Yarina,
- PSU: Faculty Enhancement Fund; Vision 2025
Fearing the tide: The resettlement debate in West Point, Liberia

By Arladne Baskin on 27 March 2017 Housing, Slums, Urban Development

Source: UrbanAfrica.net

Senegal City Races to Move Families as Sea Swallows Homes

4 APRIL, 2018 BY TRUST.ORG IN AFRICA, FLOOD PROTECTION

A scheme backed by the World Bank aims to resettle 10,000 residents from the crumbling coast of Saint-Louis.

Awa Tall poses for a photo with her baby in front of houses damaged by coastal erosion and rising sea levels, Saint-Louis, Senegal, March 16, 2018. Thomson Reuters Foundation/Velile Peyton
Orange Island

Africa's largest city has a habit of kicking out its poor to make room for the rich

Gracefield Island
Cyclone victims face bleak prospects in Mozambique resettlement sites

‘We used to have our farms. Now we rely entirely on food from aid groups.’

Mutua resettlement site used to be forest land before roughly 2,000 residents arrived here in May. (Philip Kleinfield/TNH)
The different futures that lie ahead.

+1.5 °C

+2 °C

+3 °C
What are the typologies of successful relocations?

Who defines success? Success for whom?

What metrics should we use to determine success?

Image: Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women, 2009
Article search methodology
: managed retreat (2000-2021)

Search Terms- “managed retreat” OR “planned retreat”;
“planned relocation” OR “planned resettlement” AND climate;
“managed realignment”; “climate migration”

Database- Google Scholar
(n=17,368)

Database- Web of Science
(n=633)

Refine Search Result-
Excluded: climate migration mobility patterns

Theoretical
(Excluded)

Empirical Case Studies
(n=172)

Based on reading
(See Ajibade et al. 2020)

Ongoing/ Proposed
(n=42)

Post-Resettlement
(n=96)

Success Models
(n=60)

Coded as either successful or unsuccessful

Duplicate case studies were removed
Intergenerational Justice

Managed Retreat

Recognition Justice

Social Justice

Restorative Justice

Ecological Justice

Environmental Justice

Success typologies:
- Techno-Managerial (T M)
- Ecological Restorative (E)
- Compensatory (C)
- Reformative (R)
- Transformative (T)
Success typologies by Type (n = 60)

- Technomanagerial: 40%
- Ecological Restorative: 17.8%
- Reformative: 15.6%
- Compensatory: 15.6%
- Transformative: 4.4%
# Households relocated by socio-economic class

- Low Income: 221,325 (98%)
- Low-Mid: 1,556
- Middle: 843
- Unknown: 1,860
Success typologies by location (n=60)

- **Techno-Managerial**: North 2, South 15
- **Eco-Restorative**: North 2, South 11
- **Compensatory**: North 18
- **Reformative**: North 4, South 6
- **Transformative**: North 1, South 1

Frequency of success typologies.
Decision-making approaches

- **Top Down**: 57%
- **Collaborative**: 20%
- **Polygovernance**: 14%
- **Bottom Up**: 9%
Retreat, Justice & Success
Techno-managerial typology

Solomon Islands

Albert et al., 2018
Compensatory-restorative typology

TRUST APPROVES $15 MILLION FOR GREEN ACRES LAND ACQUISITIONS AND FLOOD PROPERTY BUYOUTS

Photo: NJ Environment news
Reformative typology

Iloilo, City
Philippines

Just adaptation? Generating new vulnerabilities and shaping adaptive capacities through the politics of climate-related resettlement in a Philippine coastal city

Justin See*, Brooke Wilmsen

*Department of Social Inquiry, La Trobe University, Melbourne, Victoria 3086, Australia

See and Wilmsen, 2020
a. Typical house constructed by first NGO

b. Typical house constructed by other NGOs

See and Wilmsen, 2020
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NGO</th>
<th>Average Monthly Income per Household (Php)</th>
<th>% Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Before Resettlement</td>
<td>After Resettlement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>11,662.64</td>
<td>16,914.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>6,091.38</td>
<td>8,021.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>7,245.81</td>
<td>9,346.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>9,023.40</td>
<td>11,793.74</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* p < 0.05; ** p < 0.001.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>NGO A Before</th>
<th>NGO A After</th>
<th>NGO B Before</th>
<th>NGO B After</th>
<th>NGO C Before</th>
<th>NGO C After</th>
<th>NGO D Before</th>
<th>NGO D After</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Electricity</td>
<td>2.84</td>
<td>4.71*</td>
<td>2.16</td>
<td>2.77**</td>
<td>2.42</td>
<td>2.71</td>
<td>2.53</td>
<td>2.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water</td>
<td>2.38</td>
<td>4.50**</td>
<td>2.13</td>
<td>2.51**</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>2.52**</td>
<td>2.35</td>
<td>2.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toilet</td>
<td>2.76</td>
<td>4.75**</td>
<td>2.67</td>
<td>2.82</td>
<td>2.42</td>
<td>2.90*</td>
<td>2.82</td>
<td>2.98*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Transport</td>
<td>2.18</td>
<td>4.31**</td>
<td>2.28</td>
<td>2.56*</td>
<td>1.94</td>
<td>2.26*</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>4.86**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* p < 0.05; ** p < 0.001.
Reformative Typology

- Rweru Model Green village, Rwanda

Dale and Ajibade, 2022 (under review review)
Covid-19 food emergence response program in Bugesera district – Rweru IDP Model village / Tuesday-3rd November 2020
Transformative typology

- Vunidogoloa to Kenani, Fiji

Source and image credit: Clothilde Tronquet (2015)
Transformative typology

- The ENLACE Project, Caño Martín Peña, Puerto Rico
How?

Self-determination

Participation

Robust planning

Capacity building & social cohesion

Risk mitigation

Acceptance of trade-offs

Land rights and tenureship

Funding

Livelihoods & social services

Culture & social networks

Flipping the System!
Thank You!

Questions or Comments:
Contact Jola Ajibade @jolaadapts
jajibade@pdx.edu