Preventing Domestic Violence and Its Consequences for Community Health and Wellbeing

Arnold Chandler, Forward Change
Overview

• About Forward Change

• The Perils of Taking the “Short View”: The Case of Mandatory Arrest

• A Life Course Perspective on Domestic Violence Prevention: Taking the “Long View”

• Moving Toward Life Course Prevention: Proven and Promising Interventions
Forward Change is a mission-driven social change strategy consulting firm that seeks to improve the life outcomes and opportunities for children, young adults and families living in low-income disadvantaged communities.

We do this by helping foundations, governments and community organizations adopt social change strategies that match the best that research has to offer with the on-the-ground leadership in communities.
The Perils of Taking the “Short View”: The Case of Mandatory Arrest
The Perils of Taking the Short View: Mandatory Arrest

- Early study out of Milwaukee of mandatory arrest laws showed impact on recidivism...

  Mandatory arrest laws require police officers to make an arrest if there is an allegation of domestic violence, regardless of whether the victim wishes to press charges.

  The Milwaukee Domestic Violence Experiment (1987-88) found that mandatory arrest reduced revictimization in the 6 month follow up leading to the adoption of mandatory arrest laws across the country.

- Increased death rates of domestic violence victims from arresting vs. warning suspects

  In a 23-year follow-up to those randomized to “arrest” vs “warning,” victims were found to be 64% more likely to die of all-cause mortality (most commonly heart disease) if their abuser was arrested rather than warned. The effect was concentrated among black women (whose risk rose by 100% compared to 9% for whites), particularly if they had jobs at the time (+420%). Sherman and Harris (2014)

- Arrests don’t reduce domestic violence re-occurrence

  National study of domestic violence incidents between 1996-2012, it was found arrests had zero effect on rates of revictimization for victims. Xie and Lynch (2016)

- Mandatory arrest increased IPV homicides

  Using a quasi-experimental design researchers found that states adopting those laws saw a 60 percent increase in intimate partner homicides compared to states that did not. Iyengar,(2007)
A Life Course Approach to Domestic Violence Prevention: Taking the "Long View"
What does it mean to take a life course approach?

Taking the **long view**

Thinking about how all of the outcomes of a person’s life relate to each other, specifically **how things that happen earlier in a person’s life shapes what happens later** in their lives.

Focusing on changing life **trajectories** for years down the road.
AT WHAT AGE DOES DOMESTIC VIOLENCE PEAK IN THE GENERAL POPULATION?

IPV peaks during the early 20s for the mother and during early childhood for their children.

50% of children directly exposed to domestic violence are under the age of 6.

Fantuzzo et al (2007)

**Figure 1.** Age curve for IPV perpetration by gender from age 13 to 28.

Scanned the Literature: Conducted a scan for systematic reviews and meta-analyses of the peer-reviewed literature that identify predictors of "domestic violence" or "intimate partner violence."

Longitudinal Studies: From those reviews, along with additional searches identified longitudinal studies that measure a risk factor for domestic violence before the domestic violence occurs. Cross-sectional studies can't establish "temporal order".

Limited to larger longitudinal studies: Narrowed the several dozen studies identified to only those that were "prospective" not "retrospective", that had a sample with n=400 for identifying small effects, that included more than two waves and several control variables.

In total 25 longitudinal studies were identified.

The reported effect sizes on the next slides were determined using multivariate and multinomial logistic regression to establish the independent effect of the risk factor on domestic violence outcome(s) when controlling for several covariates.
## Life Course Predictors for Adult Domestic Violence Perpetration

### Risk Factors for Adult Domestic Violence Perpetration (ages 19 to 26)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>0-5</th>
<th>6-11</th>
<th>12-18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Life Course Outcomes:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Alcohol Use</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Witnessing Parental violence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large violent Peer Networks (&gt;13 friends)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Witnessing Severe Parental Violence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Partner Verbal Abuse</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-exclusive Relationship</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronic Violent Offending</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Developmental Factors:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive attitude toward IPV</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct Disorder</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exposure to parental violence</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child physical abuse</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual Abuse</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Effect Sizes
- **Moderate:** 1.9
- **Small to Moderate:** 2.1
- **Small:** 1.7

### Recommendations
- Use different icons for EFs, LCOs, and DFs
- Show some mediation pathways
- Add Teen Dating Violence
- Remove effect sizes
EARLY RISK PATHWAYS TO DOMESTIC VIOLENCE PERPETRATION IN ADULTHOOD

**EARLY CHILDHOOD**
- Early Childhood IPV Exposure (ages 1-5)

**CHILDHOOD**
- Childhood IPV Exposure
- Childhood Abuse
- Childhood Physical Abuse

**ADOLESCENT**
- Adolescent IPV Exposure
- Adolescent Peer-Influenced

**Predictors on prior slide**
- Adolescent Externalizing Behavior
- PTSD & Substance Abuse
- Adult Antisocial Personality Disorder
- Alcohol Abuse (women)
- Antisocial Behavior

**Young Adult IPV Perpetration (ages 19-26)**
Moving Toward Life Course Prevention: Proven and Promising Interventions
Most Domestic Violence Incidents in Families don’t interact with the criminal justice or domestic violence systems

In a nationally representative sample of families with children in which a domestic violence incident occurred:

1. **25.2%** of family violence incidents led to **police contact**

2. **11.8%** of family violence incidents led to an **arrest**

3. **8.3%** of incidents led to the filing of **criminal charges**

4. **3.1%** of incidents resulted in a **conviction or guilty plea**

5. **1.9%** resulted in sentencing to **prison or jail**

6. **14.9%** of incidents led to contact by a **Domestic Violence advocate**

KEY TAKEAWAYS FROM THE LITERATURE ON RECIDIVISM PREVENTION

The vast majority of domestic violence incidents do not become involved in the Domestic Violence system

Most core components of the domestic violence system are weak on prevention even though their focus is only on re-occurrence of domestic violence.

Law-enforcement aspects of the domestic violence system, focused as they are on arrest and prosecution, appear to produce more harm than good for victims. The punitive deterrence paradigm is largely counterproductive.

Intensive domestic violence advocacy survivor services generally appear beneficial

Batterer Intervention Programs (BIPs) that receive public funding to serve court-mandated abusers do not appear effective at reducing domestic violence recidivism.
SCANS FOR PROVEN AND PROMISING STRATEGIES

1. Proven or Promising Programs for Preventing DV and Family Violence

2. Proven Programs for Mitigating the Consequences of DV and Family Violence for those exposed
### Proven or Promising Programs to Prevent Domestic and Family Violence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age Range</th>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Effectiveness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-10 mos</td>
<td>NIH-DC Initiative</td>
<td>OR=.48 IRR=.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-5</td>
<td>Healthy Start</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-11</td>
<td>Safe Dates</td>
<td>-19% moderate IPV -49% severe IPV -68% in sexual IPV -6% in psych IPV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12-18</td>
<td>Youth Relationship Project</td>
<td>-45% physical IPV</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-26</td>
<td>Prevention and Relationship Enhancement Program</td>
<td>Community Advocacy Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27-30</td>
<td>High Point Offender-Focused DV Initiative</td>
<td>High Point Offender-Focused DV Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Parent-Child Interaction Therapy</td>
<td>-61% Child Abuse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nurse Family Partnership</td>
<td>OR=.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Green Dot Bystander Program</td>
<td>-62% physical dating violence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Fourth R: Skills for Youth Relationships</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community Advocacy Project</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Motivational Interviewing</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fathers for Change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Behavioral Couples Therapy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Healthcare Setting</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Home Visitation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>School-Based</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Law-Enforcement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Community-Based Services Agency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:**
- **OR** = Odds Ratio
- **IRR** = Incidence Rate Ratio

**Effectiveness Metrics:**
- **IPV** = Intimate Partner Violence
- **Child Abuse**
- **Behavioral Couples Therapy**
- **Substance Abuse**
- **Domestic Violence**
- **CBT** = Cognitive Behavioral Therapy

**Additional Details:**
- **-19% moderate IPV**
- **-49% severe IPV**
- **-68% in sexual IPV**
- **-6% in psych IPV**
- **-21% sexual IPV**
- **-62% physical dating violence**
- **-30% physical IPV**
- **-45% IPV arrests**
- **-45% IPV arrests**
### KEY TAKEAWAYS: IPV PREVENTION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Early Programs generally:</th>
<th>Therapeutic community-based Programs generally:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• have large RCTs ✓</td>
<td>• have small RCTs x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• have longer follow-ups ✓</td>
<td>• have shorter follow-ups x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• are dual-generation ✓</td>
<td>• aren’t dual-generation x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• don’t have obvious equity/external validity issues ✓</td>
<td>• have external validity issues x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School-based Programs generally:</th>
<th>IPV Advocacy and Batterer’s Intervention Programs have conflicting evidence x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• have large RCTS ✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• have longer follow-ups ✓</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• aren’t dual generation x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• have some equity/external validity issues [except Green Dot] x</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Programs to Mitigate the Consequences of IPV

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time Period</th>
<th>Programs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-10 mos</td>
<td>NIH-DC Initiative, Healthy Start, Nurse Family Partnership, Project Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0-5</td>
<td>Child-Parent Psychotherapy, Trauma-Focused Cognitive Behavioral Therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6-11</td>
<td>Trauma-Focused Cognitive Behavioral Therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12-18</td>
<td>Helping to Overcome PTSD through Empowerment (HOPE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19-26</td>
<td>Cognitive Trauma Therapy for Battered Women, Relapse Prevention and Relationship Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27-30</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- OR = 0.48
- IRR = 0.82
- 72% clinical conduct problems
Early Programs generally:
- have large RCTs ✔
- have longer follow-ups ✔
- have dual-generation ✔
- don’t have obvious equity/external validity issues ✔

Therapeutic Programs for Adult IPV Survivors generally:
- have small RCTS ❌
- have shorter follow-ups ❌
- aren’t dual generation ❌
- don’t have obvious equity/external validity issues ✔

**KEY TAKEAWAYS: PROGRAMS TO MITIGATE THE CONSEQUENCES OF IPV**
Recommended Strategies for Life Course Prevention of Domestic Violence
RECOMMENDED DIRECTIONS FOR DEEP PREVENTION OF DOMESTIC VIOLENCE

1. Couples Therapy/Conjoint Treatment for Parents engaged in DV
2. Dual-Generation early DV Prevention and Mitigation
3. Family-Integrated Adolescent DV Prevention
4. Trauma Recovery Treatment for Mothers and their Older Children (ages 7-15) experiencing DV
5. Substance Abuse targeted DV Prevention for Parents of Children
6. Restorative Justice Diversion Programs for Parents involved in DV
## Couples Therapy/Conjoint Treatment for Parents

- Programs conducted in home settings and community centers
- Focused on helping parental couples who are engaged in situational violence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Evidence Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Domestic-Violence-Focused Couples' Therapy</td>
<td>The intervention was designed to address situational couple violence. Situational couple violence is described as a couple dynamic in which conflicts may escalate unintentionally to minor violence. The model is intended for couples experiencing mild to moderate violence who want to stay together and want to end the violence in their relationship</td>
<td>Promising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Behavioral Couples Therapy</td>
<td>Targeted to males substance abusers and their non-abusing partners. The programs includes 32 sessions (60 min each) with both partners attending 12 BCT treatment sessions together. In these 12 sessions, the non–substance-abusing partner was an active participant in the intervention.</td>
<td>Promising</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Dual-Generation Early IPV Prevention and Mitigation

### Intervention Name

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intervention Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Evidence Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The NIH-DC Initiative to Reduce Infant Mortality in Minority Populations</td>
<td>Pregnant mothers receive an integrated cognitive behavioral therapy intervention over 8 OBGYN visits</td>
<td>Proven at Scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Healthy Start</td>
<td>Home visits by paraprofessionals providing direct services</td>
<td>Proven at scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nurse Family Partnership (Denver)</td>
<td>Nurse home visiting program that improve maternal and fetal health during pregnancy; improve children's health and personal development and enhances mother's personal development.</td>
<td>Proven at scale</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic Violence Enhanced Perinatal Home Visits (DOVE)</td>
<td>DOVE is a structured brochure-based IPV empowerment intervention based on the March of Dimes Protocol for Prevention of Battering during pregnancy.</td>
<td>Promising</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Programs conducted in healthcare settings, home visits and child centers
- Focused on reducing IPV victimization for mother, IPV exposure and abuse for child and improving the recovery from exposure to traumatic experiences for both mother and child
- Targeting mothers and their children ages 0-6
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Intervention Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Evidence Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Families for Safe Dates</td>
<td>Families receive the Families for Safe Dates program which includes six mailed activity booklets followed-up by health educator telephone calls.</td>
<td>Promising</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Family-Integrated Adolescent IPV Prevention

- Programs conducted in home settings
- Focused on reducing violence in teenage dating relationships
- Targets adolescents and their parents
### Trauma recovery treatment for mothers and their older children

- Programs conducted in home settings, community centers or shelters
- Focused on helping mothers and their children recover from trauma associated with IPV
- Targets mothers and their children in middle childhood and early adolescence that have experienced IPV

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Evidence Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trauma-Focused Cognitive Behavioral Therapy (TF-CBT)</td>
<td>A community-based program serving children ages 7-14 with IPV-related PTSD symptoms through 8 session of TF-CBT.</td>
<td>Proven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Project Support</td>
<td>A home-visitation intervention addressing conduct problems in IPV-exposed children ages 4-9.</td>
<td>Proven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cognitive Trauma Therapy for Battered Women (CTT-BW)</td>
<td>CTT-BW involves individual therapy provided in eight to eleven 90-minute sessions for IPV survivors.</td>
<td>Proven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HOPE: Helping to Overcome PTSD through Empowerment</td>
<td>A shelter-based CBT treatment program for IPV victims</td>
<td>Promising</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Substance Abuse Targeted IPV Prevention for Parents

- Programs conducted in community centers
- Focused on helping substance abusing parents or partners engaged in IPV to reduce their substance and partner abuse

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Substance Abuse Domestic Violence (SADV) Cognitive Behavioral Therapy</td>
<td>It is a 12-week intervention that can be delivered to groups or as an individual treatment. It also allows for partner participation in 4 of the 12 sessions. The couple sessions use aspects of behavior couple therapy to increase positive interactions and couple communication.</td>
<td>Promising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relapse Prevention and Relationship Safety (RPRS)</td>
<td>The RPRS program is comprised of 11 2-hour group sessions and 1 individual session designed to promote relationship safety and reduce drug use. The RPRS sessions were conducted twice weekly for 6 weeks. The RPRS employs strategies derived from social cognitive and empowerment theories to enable participants to avoid IPV and drug use.</td>
<td>Promising</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fathers for Change</td>
<td>Designed specifically for fathers of children under 12 years with a history of IPV who abuse drugs or alcohol. The model is a 16- to 20-session individual intervention that includes optional co-parent and child involvement in later portions of the treatment.</td>
<td>Promising</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**RESTORATIVE JUSTICE DIVERSION PROGRAMS FOR PARENTS**

Restorative Justice Diversion Programs for Parents

- Programs conducted in home settings, community centers
- Focused on parental couples and used as an alternative to Batter Intervention Programs based on the Duluth Model or CBT-only

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Evidence Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Circles of Peace Restorative Justice Program</td>
<td>Circles of Peace in Nogales, AZ is a 26-week domestic violence treatment program. It is a court-referred program that uses the circle process to work with domestic violence offenders.</td>
<td>Promising</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contact
Arnold Chandler
arnold@arnoldchandler.com
CITATIONS

- Sherman and Harris (2014) “Increased death rates of domestic violence victims from arresting vs. warning suspects in the Milwaukee Domestic Violence Experiment”
- Lagdon et al (2014) “Adult experience of mental health outcomes as a result of intimate partner violence victimisation: a systematic review”
PRIMARY EXPOSURE PATHWAYS TO IPV PERPETRATION IN EMERGING ADULTHOOD (AGES 20-26)

EARLY CHILDHOOD

- Early Childhood IPV Exposure to Adolescent Externalizing Behavior Pathway [Naryan et al, (2013) Developmental timing and continuity of exposure to interparental violence and externalizing behavior as prospective predictors of dating violence]

CHILDHOOD

- Childhood IPV Exposure to later PTSD and/or Substance Abuse Pathway [Brown et al, (2015) Adverse childhood experiences and intimate partner aggression in the US: Sex differences and similarities in psychosocial mediation]


- Childhood Abuse to Adult Antisocial Personality Disorder pathway [White and Widom (2013) Intimate Partner Violence Among Abused and Neglected Children in Young Adulthood]

- Childhood Abuse to later Alcohol Problems for women pathway [White and Widom (2013) Intimate Partner Violence Among Abused and Neglected Children in Young Adulthood]

ADOLESCENT


CITATIONS FOR PROVEN PROGRAMS

NIH-DC Initiative
- Michelle Kieley (2011) “An Integrated Intervention to Reduce Intimate Partner Violence in Pregnancy: A Randomized Controlled Trial”

Healthy Start

Parent-Child Interaction Therapy

Nurse Family Partnership

Safe Dates

The Fourth R: Skills for Youth Relationships

Green Dot Bystander Program

Youth Relationship Project
CITATIONS FOR PROVEN PROGRAMS

Community Advocacy Project
- Deborah Bybee et al (2005) Predicting re-victimization of battered women 3 years after exiting a shelter program.

Prevention and Relationship Enhancement Program

Motivational Interviewing

The Duluth Model: Batterers Intervention Programs

Fathers for Change

High Point Offender-Focused DV Initiative

Substance Abuse Domestic Violence CBT

Behavioral Couples Therapy
### CITATIONS FOR PROGRAMS TO MITIGATE CONSEQUENCES OF IPV

- **NIH-DC Initiative**
  - Michelle Kieley (2011) “An Integrated Intervention to Reduce Intimate Partner Violence in Pregnancy: A Randomized Controlled Trial”

- **Healthy Start**

- **Child-Parent Psychotherapy**
  - Alicia F. Lieberman (2006) “Child-Parent Psychotherapy: 6-Month Follow-up of a Randomized Controlled Trial”

- **Nurse Family Partnership**

- **Project Support**

- **Trauma-Focused Cognitive Behavioral Therapy**

- **Cognitive Trauma Therapy for Battered Women**

- **Helping to Overcome PTSD through Empowerment (HOPE)**
  - Dawn M. Zlotnick (2011) “Cognitive-Behavioral Treatment of PTSD in Residents of Battered Women Shelters: Results of a Randomized Clinical Trial”