Lessons from an Evaluation of Baltimore's Safe Streets Program: A Community-Based Public Health Approach to Prevent Gun Violence

> Daniel Webster, ScD, MPH Deputy Director for Research Johns Hopkins Center for the Prevention of Youth Violence

Paving 'Safe Streets' - Ex-offenders are mentoring the young and mediating disputes to stop violence that may be a trigger-pull away *The Baltimore Sun 2/11/08*



Roll Out of Safe Streets Baltimore

- McElderry Park (East) July 2007 present
- Union Square (SW) Nov. '07 July '08.
- Ellwood Park (East) March 2008-June 2010
- Madison-Eastend_Nov. 2008 June 2010
- Cherry Hill (South) Nov. 2008 present
- Mondawmin (West Balt) April 2012 June 2016
- Lower Park Heights (NW) May 2013 present

Attitudinal questions on legitimacy of using guns to settle disputes.

Do you think it's okay to shoot/ threaten someone with a gun when 	Yes	No	Maybe
I am at a club with my girl and this guy is dancing with her.			
I see a guy on the street who beat up my brother last week.			
I see a guy on the street who robbed me of \$50 and my Timberland boots			
I see a guy who has not paid me the \$100 he owes me.			
A guy disrespects me on the street in front of my friends. I think the guy is carrying a gun.			

Risk factors among participants across neighborhoods

	McElderry Pk	Union Square	Oliver	signif.
Ever shot/shot at wave 1	50%	52%	62%	.369
wave 2	47%		40%	.452
Sibling shot/shot at wave 1	43%	48%	53%	.597
wave 2	56%		31%	.007
Ever arrested wave 1	72%	60%	71%	.322
wave 2	89%		58%	.002

Estimates from multinomial logistic regression on strong support for using guns to resolve conflicts in survey <u>wave 1</u>.

	aOR	Signif.
Age	1.23	.107
Ever arrested	0.49	.239
Ever shot or shot at	2.96	.079
Sibling ever shot or shot at	1.33	.625
Friends' support for gun violence	1.46	<.001
McElderry Park / Safe Streets	0.14	<.001

Estimates from multinomial logistic regression on strong support for using guns to resolve conflicts in survey wave 2.

	aOR	Signif.
Age	0.98	.469
Ever arrested	2.49	.209
Ever shot or shot at	2.62	.146
Sibling ever shot or shot at	2.59	.625
Friends' support for gun violence	1.28	<.001
McElderry Park / Safe Streets	0.13	.008

Effects of Program on Youth Attitudes in Lower Park Heights

Milam et al., 2016 in press, J Urban Health

- Pre-test Post-Test with Comparison Community (N=1329). Anonymous street surveys of youth ages 18-24. Attitudinal measures reliable and valid. (Milam et al., 2016)
- 43% of the attitudes in intervention community post-intervention improved over 1 year vs. 13% improvement in the control community. Intervention X time interaction associated with less support of using guns to resolve conflicts.

Estimating Program Impact on Gun Violence

- Multiple interrupted time-series with nonintervention comparisons – monthly counts for each police post.
- Controlled for law enforcement practices directed at violent offenders, neighborhood redevelopment, month, and year.
- Variance adjusted for correlated data. No spatial autocorrelation.

Estimates for intervention effects on homicides through May 2012

	% change	Z	P> z
VCIS deployment	-23	-2.02	.043
Safe Streets – McElderry Park	-21	-2.24	.025
Safe Streets – Elwood Park	+13	1.27	.204
Safe Streets – Madison-East End	+203	5.41	<.001
Safe Streets – Cherry Hill	-34	-4.26	<.001

Model estimates for effects on nonfatal shooting incidents through May 2012

	% change	z	P> z
VCIS deployment	-15	-1.61	.108
Northwest Dist. offender call-in	-40	-3.23	.001
Safe Streets – McElderry Park	+5	0.85	.398
Safe Streets – Elwood Park	-34	-6.15	<.001
Safe Streets – Madison-East End	-41	-4.52	<.001
Safe Streets – Cherry Hill	-9	-1.20	.231

Connecting dots between program implementation and violence reduction

- Overall program-related reductions in gun violence.
- Positive spill-over effects in some adjacent posts
- Safe Streets staff effects similar to detectives in violence unit (later disbanded due to abuse).
- Homicide reductions connected to conflict mediations.

Evidence on the Effectiveness of Strategies to Reduce Homicides and Shootings in Baltimore

> Daniel W. Webster, ScD, MPH Cassandra Crifasi, PhD, MPH Shani Buggs, MPH Seema Choksy, MPP Emma E. McGinty, PhD, MS Frank Curriero, PhD

Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health

Estimated Impact Through 2015

	Homicides	Shootings	
	% change	% change	
Aggregate	-3%	-27%**	
McElderry Park	-22%	-12%	
Elwood Park (20 months)	+151%**	-29%	
Cherry Hill	-44%*	-41%*	
Mondawmin	+50%	-18%	
Lower Park Heights	-44%	-28%	

Estimates of Safe Streets effects on gun violence (homicides + NFS)

	% change	P value
Average Safe Streets effect 2007-2014	-19%	.068
McElderry Park	-23%	.197
Elwood Park (18 months)	+6	.810
Cherry Hill	-45%	.007
Mondawmin	+18%	.559
Park Heights homicides nonfatal shootings	-38% 0%	<.001 .914

Other Relevant Findings

- Safe Streets had larger impact on shootings than any law enforcement intervention.
- East Baltimore Redevelopment: -33% homicides, -24% shootings.
- Focused deterrence gang/drug intervention no effect on homicides, linked to more shootings.
- Surges in drug arrests followed by increased shootings. Detectives focused on illegal guns and offenders linked to fewer shootings.

Concluding Thoughts

• Program can work if implemented well.

 But it should be strengthened. More robust effort to change norms with media, community allies.

 Need economic incentives – jobs, stipends.