

Principles & Values to Guide Actions Relevant to Foreign Government Interference in University Research



Kent Fuchs
President, University of Florida

Farnam Jahanian
President, Carnegie Mellon University

Pivotal Moment for U.S. Innovation and Global Competition

- We are in the middle of **a pivotal moment for U.S. innovation and global competition.** This context is profoundly shaping the national dialogue and policy landscape regarding international collaboration. We are experiencing:
 - A historic acceleration in the pace and scale of technological advances;
 - A profound re-shaping of our workforce; and
 - Intense competition from motivated challengers, including and especially China.

Out-Innovating and Responding to Threat of Foreign Influence

- The United States faces an urgent need to respond to this challenge, including:
 - The need to invest in research to out-innovate our competitors;
 - The need to win the global race for talent; and
 - The need to create bolder strategies for transitioning discoveries from lab to market.
- We recognize that foreign government influence is a direct threat to our nation's security and economic prosperity. **We take this seriously.**
- To preserve and enhance the diverse research, education, and innovation ecosystem that has fueled our nation's broad prosperity since World War II, we must be both open **and** secure.

U.S. Government Response

- There is **bipartisan consensus** on the need for increased federal investment in research and for aggressive measures to address threat of foreign interference.
- There are a variety of legislative and executive actions. Proposals include:
 - Improving information exchange regarding threats between U.S. universities and the national science and security agencies.
 - Multiple new and expanded reporting requirements and reviews of foreign gifts or contracts to U.S. universities and colleges by various federal agencies, including requiring approval by the Committee on Foreign Investment in the United States (CFIUS) for gifts and contracts related to select technologies.
 - Restricting participation in “foreign government talent recruitment programs.”
 - Shifting responsibility for coordinating agency/university security policy from the science agencies and OSTP to the Office of Management and Budget.

Response and Actions by Universities

- Universities are taking the concerns seriously, including:
 - Support of Numerous Legislative and Regulatory Efforts
 - Enhanced Communications and Training
 - Enhanced Campus Coordination Efforts
 - Strengthened COI and COC Requirements
 - Enhanced Scrutiny of Research Activities
 - Review of Collaborations, Contracts, and Foreign Gifts
 - Foreign Travel Safeguards and Protections
 - Cooperation with Security Agencies
- Ensure Due Process for Faculty and Students with Respect to Federal Investigations
- AAU-APLU Effective Practices Document

AAU-APLU Presidential Research Security Working Group

- The working group is a joint association effort to help develop a common voice among the university community on this key issue.
- Their charge is to advise the associations on strategies to protect the core academic values and integrity of research conducted by U.S. universities from foreign interference.
- Convened in March 2020, the group includes 17 leaders drawn from America's private and public research institutions in all regions of the nation.



Key Findings

1. Universities take the threat seriously and are responding to this new environment.
2. There is an essential need for strengthening and systematizing real-time communication with national security officials.
3. Sustaining our ability to attract talent from across the world is essential to a robust U.S. research enterprise.
4. Universities need to establish clear principles and values to guide their actions and to help them protect themselves from foreign government interference.

How Do We Secure and Protect U.S. University Research?

1. Common Values

This section outlines common values of AAU and APLU universities relevant to foreign government interference in research. This outline can serve as a guide for the formulation of new initiatives and policies, including new partnerships with institutions in other nations that may not share all the same values. The list is not intended to be comprehensive, and each of the values should be considered in the context of specific situations.

2. Principles for Government Actions in Protecting and Ensuring the Future of the United States University Research Enterprise

This section outlines broad principles that should guide government actions in countering foreign government interference. The principles should be considered for any new legislation or policies in this arena.

3. Principles for Universities in Responding to Foreign Government Interference

This section outlines broad principles for actions by universities themselves that will counter the effects of foreign government interference and enhance the strength of the university research enterprise.

Common Values

The AAU and APLU Universities share common high-level values associated with their education, research, and economic development activities. While they may be framed differently by each institution, common elements relevant to foreign government interference include:

- Academic Freedom
- Free Expression
- Inclusion and Diversity
- National Interest
- Transparency
- Integrity
- Zero Tolerance for Harassment and Coercion
- Collaboration

Principles to Guide Government Actions

- Limit Restrictions on Research
- Protect the Integrity of the Research Enterprise
- Encourage Sharing of Research Results
- Provide Clear Guidance for Any Controls on Information
- Enable the Recruitment and Retention of Talent
- Support the Establishment and Maintenance of International Collaborations
- Build Transparency Regarding Foreign Interference

Principles to Guide Universities in Responding

- Protection of Institutional Values
- Protection of the Status of Fundamental Research
- Transparency and Accountability Regarding External Interests and Activities
- Protection of Information and materials
- Informing Researchers Regarding Risks Engagement with International Talent
- Support for Commercialization and the Protection of IP
- Access to Research Results
- Continued Engagement and Investment in Research
- Engagement with Government on Standards for the Integrity of the Research Enterprise

Case Study of the Implementation of the New Security Measures on Campus

- Florida
- Campus Awareness and Response
- State Legislature Initiatives
- Outlook for Future Action

Why is Getting this Right so Important?

- Need to recognize the importance and value of foreign talent to advancing U.S. science
- Need to protect scientific openness
- Need to define, uphold, and defend clear ethical standards for the conduct of scientific research
- Need to preserve national security

Discussion: Next Steps for Applying the Principles

- In setting institutional policy?
- In establishing expectations for responsible conduct of research?
- In developing international partnerships and working with other foreign universities, university associations and foreign governments (e.g., G7 Research Compact and the new G7 Working Group on the Security and Integrity of the Research Ecosystem)?